

Anything that happens after six months -- I am not an authority but I believe those who are authorities feel that if you get a growth persisting or increasing after that time, you had better get busy and do something about it, or you cannot rely on what they have already had to cure the case.

BY MR. MURPHY: Q. I suppose Dr. Guyatt, like others, you have observed some cremations done by radium before the individual died? A. There have been accidents, yes. You cannot destroy a tumor without destroying some of the other tissues. That is reasonable.

-- The witness retired.

THE CHAIRMAN: Before you leave, Mr. Murphy, I think I would like to have Miss Caisse's position definitely on the record respecting her formula, and whether she has changed or not, and any observations to the Board you have to make in connection with me.

We have heard more case histories from Miss Caisse than from any other sponsor. She is the only sponsor, I think now who has not been willing to disclose her formula. I do not remember any others. Every other applicant has done so, and I would like to have it definitely on the record what her position is now.

MR. MURPHY: I think her position is the same. She would like the Commission, having heard this evidence, to pass upon it, and she will quite willingly abide by that decision.

*
v.i.

END OF
GUYATT'S
TESTIMONY

MHC

THE CHAIRMAN: In other words, she is not prepared to give her formula?

MR. MURPHY: No.

THE CHAIRMAN: Or to supply samples, or permit it to be used?

MR. MURPHY: No, she is not. ←

THE CHAIRMAN: We are in a position -- what she is asking us to do is to pass on the case histories she has given us, without the Board having any knowledge of what the substance contains, or the theory of its operation or administration.

MR. MURPHY: Exactly.

COMMISSIONER CALLAHAN: She has made that definite. has she?

MR. MURPHY: Yes.

THE CHAIRMAN: Well, I have stated my position before, and I do not need to repeat it. I do not know whether the members of the Board have anything to say about that?

COMMISSIONER YOUNG: I take it there is no other evidence ^{with} ~~in~~ regard to Miss Caisse's treatment beyond what we have now? We have reached a point where we must make a decision on what we have. We cannot investigate in any independent way on what she is using, and ~~We~~ must just -- unless we make use of the Act, -- weigh all the evidence we have, and come to some decision.

THE CHAIRMAN: Without the benefit of any assistance which might be gained from the other ~~branch~~ ^{branches} of the investigation.

investigation.

COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Yes, I take it that is the position.

MR. MURPHY: That is the position, Dr. Young.

CC report
Dec 31/3

THE CHAIRMAN: If she is sincere-- which I presume she is -- about her substance, and if she wants to do justice to it, by having a full investigation made, which the Board might think necessary, I can only say that I think she is adopting the wrong attitude.

However, at the moment, unless the Board think it wise to use the Act, as Dr. Young says, that is her own concern.

MR. MURPHY: I presume, Mr. Chairman, after 15 years of struggle in this matter, as you will observe in some of these documents filed in the last exhibit, it has been rather a painful ordeal to bring this picture up to where one can really see it on the screen, and then too, abruptly and without seeing a safe-guard --

THE CHAIRMAN: Do not use the word abruptly; we have been listening to evidence all day.

AM

MR. MURPHY: Yes, but in the light of the Cancer Commission, just taking evidence, and not yet passing upon the merits of it, she feels she would like to have some comment with respect to the results of this thing. As you remember, it was her argument in the beginning --

THE CHAIRMAN: And has been her argument all the way through.

MR. MURPHY: Yes, based upon the results --

THE CHAIRMAN: Would you feel disposed to commit yourself to the efficacy of a remedy of which you did not know the contents, and which no medical man or authority had intimated to you whether it was good, bad or indifferent? If I made a favourable comment, and put my signature to it, and it was found to be pure water, and the effects were purely mental, I would look pretty silly, would I not? On the other hand, if it contained something else, something harmful, and we did not know it, I would still feel silly.

MR. MURPHY: That was her position from the beginning and so far she has not altered it. I presume that with her -- it is my experience -- the more tactful manner -- it would not take much difficulty to pass upon or comment or make some comment. This is all done in secret -- of what has transpired here today. I did not hear anything that helped cancer in what Dr. Noble has put in.

THE CHAIRMAN: ~~That is her position.~~ We are not speaking about Dr. Noble's criticism.

MR. MURPHY: That is her position.

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: In other words, she has gone as far as she wishes to until there is some expression from this Commission?

MR. MURPHY: Exactly.

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN; And assuming the Commission on the one hand might make a very favourable report. What then?

THE CHAIRMAN: We would not hear of her again.

MR. MURPHY: Then we could deal with the matter.

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: Yes, on the other hand, the Commission may make a very unfavourable report, what then?

MR. MURPHY: I don't know.

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: We are not in any position to do that.

MR. MURPHY: When will you resume?

THE CHAIRMAN: It has not been decided, but we have gone a long ways, and I do not feel disposed to spend public money in hearing more case histories, or clinical evidence, if Miss Caisse is not prepared to accede to the request of the members of the Board, who would like to know what the substance contains, and have it examined from some other angle.

COMMISSIONER VALIN: The medical men who have been up there -- there was no secrecy about it -- Miss Caisse is not the only one who is having results with cancer cures. There are others who have come before this Commission who have had possibly better results with the other cures, and they came out openly and gave them to us.

MR. MURPHY: The difficulty about it is this.

The medical men who have appeared before the Board

5 sponsored and turned over their formula, whatever it may
6 be, and they are in a position to receive some recognition
7 She is not. She is not a graduate of the Univeristy, she
8 stands in no position whatsoever. University

recognition



1 COMMISSIONER VALIN: All the more reason why she
2 should help us. She is in a peculiar position. She is
3 not a graduate in medicine, and she is practicing
4 medicine.

5 MR. MURPHY: Oh, I don't think so.

6 COMMISSIONER VALIN: The treatment of cancer is
7 the practice of medicine. She really is privileged. I
8 do not think there is anybody else in any other province
9 in this country where she would be allowed to have a
10 clinic and treat patients.

11 COMMISSIONER CALLAHAN: And give medicine by mouth.

THE CHAIRMAN: I am not sure of the reading of
section 7 of the Act, whether the Commission is entitled
to make a report until they have investigated the sub-
stance.

Section No. 7 reads as follows;

" Where any substance or method of treatment is
submitted to the Commission under the provisions
of section 6, the Commission shall cause such
substance or method of treatment to be investigated
and upon the conclusion of such investigation, make
a determination or finding as to the merit or
value as a remedy for cancer of such substance
or method of treatment; provided that the
Commission may at any time before concluding its
investigation make such determination or finding
of a temporary nature as it deems proper, and
every determination or finding of the Commission



Handwritten signature or initials.



" shall be recorded in the minutes of the Commission "

As I read it, it seems to me that the determination of the finding is subsequent to the submission of the substance or method of treatment.

I am not sure that we are in a position to make a determination under the Act until that is done. I am not curious about the formula in any way. I am thinking of our position, in dealing with the matter, when she gives us part of it, and keeps the rest of it back.

MR. MURPHY: Of course, the ^{position} psotion is, I presume once you turn in the formula -- the formula might be just as you say; it might be perfectly good, or it might be found by somebody in the Toronto University to be of no use whatsoever. They will treat guinea pigs, and mice with it for a while, and they have in the past and then they may say. " It is no good." And then there you are at the end of the road, when apparently a great number of people are satisfied with the results that they have obtained.

COMMISSIONER YOUNG: I would like to be perfectly clear on this point. My understanding is that at the present time Miss Caisse refused to allow anybody else to use her treatment, and she proposes to hold that position in the future.

MR. MURPHY: Yes, she has.

COMMISSIONER YOUNG: Supposing she has a cure for cancer, and she should die tomorrow; what happens to the people who have cancer? What about the thousands of

1 people who are dying of cancer?

2 MR. MURPHY: I understand that. I mentioned that
3 to her, and I understand she has protected that by
4 placing it, somewhere where it can be had upon her death.

crux of situation

5 COMMISSIONER YOUNG: So people up to the time she
6 dies will be dying of cancer, because there are thousands
7 who cannot be treated by her.

8 MR. MURPHY: I would not go that far.

9 COMMISSIONER VALIN: There is the problem, she has
10 a cure, or she has not. If she has a cure, and is
11 sincere when she says she has, why should she deprive
12 the whole population of that cure? 10-12

13 COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: Insulin is in use all over
14 the world. world.

15 COMMISSIONER YOUNG: If it was found that Miss
16 Caisse really the possessor of a cure for cancer, her
17 name will be known throughout the world, and she will
18 go down in history as another example of a non-medical
19 person finding something which all the medical men and
20 scientists could not find.



21 COMMISSIONER VALIN: That happened in the life of
22 Pasteur.

23 COMMISSIONER WALLACE: It is not our responsibility
24 to plead with Miss Caisse to give us the formula. If
25 she has decided not so to do, we will act accordingly.

MLL

26 THE CHAIRMAN: We will have to determine our own
27 course.

28 COMMISSIONER CALLAHAN: Mr. Murphy said that was
29 unfinished statement

THE CHAIRMAN: I wanted her definite position on the record.

MR. MURPHY: Following out what Dr. Wallace said, I do not think that in the interests of the future, as Dr. Young has said, we should be too hasty with her, She might be a little bit backward in some ways, about handing this over. Supposing the Act functioned today. They say, " We will close the clinic in Bracebridge" and then the public will raise an outcry.

Q. Whose responsibility would that be?

(purpose)

MR. MURPHY: I did not ask her today. The question was to get them here, (patients) and get it over with.

COMMISSIONER VALIN: You understand that you presented your case. We feel we are in a position where it is not possible to give a report. We want to continue this investigation with some control in the future, of cases which she will treat. Whether she controls these cases from a diagnostic standpoint, biopsies, X-rays and so forth, and follow them up and examine these patients. That is the way we feel we should conduct an investigation, if we want to do it thoroughly, before we can make an intelligent report in regard to the cure. This is an import thing.

I do not think I would like to put my name on a report at the present time, with the information I have. I have not got enough information. That is the attitude I have taken with the other sponsors of cancer cures. We do not feel, unless we can pursue our

1 investigations further, than this, that we can prepare
a report.

3 MR. MURPHY: At the moment, that is her attitude
4 I do not know what it will be now that it is all over.
5 A day sometimes changes the picture.

6 Suppose we said, " here, now, here is the formula"
7 what would be done with it, Mr. Chairman? ←

THE CHAIRMAN: At the moment, I cannot say. I am
9 not a doctor. But Dr. Valin has given you some idea
10 of what his thought on it is. That is, that there ←
11 should be further treatment under controlled conditions,
12 supervised by somebody who has knowledge of what is
13 being done, and can appreciate the results.

14 COMMISSIONER VALIN: ^(were) These things have been seen
15 for the first time four or five years ago. As far as we
16 are concerned, we had no control of them. None of us
17 saw them at that time. We saw them today, and they are
18 cured. It is pretty hard for us to pass judgment on
19 the cases we have only seen after treatment. We have
20 taken your word for it. Sometimes we have had co-oper-
21 ation her. We have had biopsies by reputable men, but
22 with most of the cases we have had no co-operation on
23 the start, no examination by medical men, and no attempts
24 made at examining these patients. She simply takes their
25 word for it.

26 A woman comes in, and says she has cancer of the
27 cervix, and she treats her. She does not put a speculum
28 up, and examine her; she cannot swear on her oath ~~but~~ that

mk

Commissioner Valin (cont'd)
that woman has cancer of the cervix. She did not see it herself. She is not a qualified diagnostician. She has no medical training.

Our idea of the method of conducting the investigation is that there will be control in the future of the new cases she is called upon to treat, that they would be seen by some member or representative of the Commission, and a complete diagnosis and examination done and then follow the cases and after a certain time we will be able to make a report. I fail to see how we can do it this way. You are seriously, I think prejudicial to your cause in not revealing the formula. ↙

We may be favourably impressed. We don't know. As far as we have gone, we cannot tell. There may be something in it, as Dr. Guyett says. He thinks it is something which should be investigated further. That is what he suggested-to have some independent investigator go ahead, and he appeals to the Ontario Medical Society to have it investigated. That is his impression, and he is a disinterested party. He is not biased. We feel we should like to pursue our observations further, and that is the reason why we want the formula -- that is the main reason. *

MR. MURPHY: Q. The only difficulty is she says that these cases which have come there have to have a proper medical certificate as to their---

COMMISSIONER VALIN: A lot of them have had improper diagnosis by the doctors.

MR

MR. MURPHY: That is pathetic.

COMMISSIONER VALIN: Yes, but there have been diagnosis which have been inaccurate.

MR. MURPHY: That throws her job to the winds.

COMMISSIONER VALIN: It does not, On the other hand, there were proper diagnosis in a few cases, but the majority of them (have) been seen by medical men, and which from our knowledge of it have been improperly diagnosed.

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: Yes, and you know how frequently the right method of diagnosis has been recommended by a physician, and not accepted by the patient.

* MR. MURPHY: Just in a few instances.

COMMISSIONER VALIN: For all you know, she may have incomplete

MR. MURPHY: I agree with Dr. Guyett, in there is something in this picture.

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: Then there is also this principle involved. If you get results based on good sound scientific work, they should be capable of being duplicated by experienced workers elsewhere, and that is a criterion of the establishment of this thing.

MR. MURPHY: You are like a good ball team with a good ball player; if you let him go, he will go to the other club, and you are out. That is the position she feels she is in, if she just hands this thing over --

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: She has no fear of it being infringed?

MR. MURPHY: I do not know what she thinks about that

Handwritten signature "Mik" and a circular stamp.

COMMISSIONER CALLAHAN: It is unfortunate that
Dr. Guyett who was so interested did not make a more
detailed investigation.

COMMISSIONER VALIN: I would have liked to have
had this investigation in a hospital today, and I would
like to have examined some of these patients.

COMMISSIONER DEADMAN: I would suggest that the
attitude of the Board regarding this matter be placed
before Mr. Murphy, and that it be left in his hands until
the next meeting of the Commission. In the meantime,
it is difficult for us to do much more.

THE CHAIRMAN: I think Mr. Murphy knows the
attitude of the Commission now.

MR. MURPHY: Yes, I do.

THE CHAIRMAN: We will advise you when the next
meeting is to be held.

MR. MURPHY: That is the best thing to be done.

BY COMMISSIONER YOUNG: It is understood we are
through hearing Miss Caisse's cases?

MR. MURPHY: Oh Yes, that is closed.

THE CHAIRMAN: Definitely.

* -- Whereupon a further general discussion between members
of the Commission was held, and not reported by the
direction of the Chairman. * *

-- Whereupon the further proceedings of this investigation
were adjourned, at 7.22 p. m. sine die.

185 pages